

# ARCHÆVS

*Études d'Histoire des Religions / Studies in the History of Religions*

**VI (2002), fasc. 1-2 & 3-4**

[print & online December 2002]

## **VI (2002), fasc. 1-2**

European Association for the Study of Religions (EASR). Minutes of the Committee Meeting and the General Assembly, September 2002. EASR Constitution, 2002.

**Evanghélos Moutsopoulos**, "La fonction catalytique de l'exaiphnes chez Denis"

The well-known historian of Ancient Philosophy, distinguished by his research of the concept of *kairos*, discusses a particular chapter of the more general problem concerning the means by which the Neo-platonic authors, from Philo of Alexandria to Plotin and Proclus, alleviated the difficulties inherent to the Parmenidian dualism. The focus of Dr Moutsopoulos' article is the question of the discontinuity of the interval between being and non-being, which the Neo-platonic authors saturated with different intermediary ontological values. Furthermore, Moutsopoulos' study tackles the category of suddenness (fr. brusque, soudain, prompt, fulgurant, subit), expressed in the writings of the neo-platonic authors by the Greek adverb *exaiphnes*. This was contrasted by another category of the discontinuous temporality, namely *kairos*. If the notion of *kairos* indicates a form of temporal discontinuity established by the active function of the conscience (i.e.: the intentionality), the notion of suddenness denotes something independent of the conscience, which is affected by it but remains fundamentally passive against it.

*Keywords:* *kairos*; Greek philosophy; Parmenidian dualism; the discontinuity of the ontological interval between being and non-being; neo-platonic authors; the category of sudden (fr. brusque; soudain; prompt; fulgurant; subit).

**Jacques Dupuis**, "Le dialogue interreligieux dans une société pluraliste" / "Interreligious Dialogue in a Plural Society"

Divided in two parts I. "The theological foundation of the dialogue", respectively II. "The challenges and the fruits of the dialogue", divided also in

three parts: 1. "Engagement and opening", 2. "Personal faith and experience of the other", 3. "Mutual enrichment", the article of Jacques Dupuis, professor of theology at the Pontifical Gregorian University of Rome, proposes a series of interrogations concerning the possibility of a real dialogue between religions in the framework of the contemporary society, of its new conditions. "Which is the new theological evaluation of the other religious traditions which we, as Christians, should maintain and promote? Which are the new attitudes face the members of the other religions that we should entertain and promote among the others?" - are leading questions to which this article tries to give reasonable answers.

*Keywords:* Personal faith and experience of the other; The challenges and the fruits of the dialogue; The theological foundation of the dialogue; Engagement and opening; the possibility of a dialogue between religions in the framework of the contemporary society;

**Mihail Neamțu**, "The Unfolding of Truth Eunomius of Cyzicus and Gregory of Nyssa in Debate over Orthodoxy (360-381)".

This study is a new attempt of reading the rich theological debates of the fourth century, which designed in different ways the Christian Creed of Nicaea (325) and Constantinople (381), focusing more especially the debate between the radical Arians (epitomized by Aetius and Eunomius) and the defenders of orthodoxy (represented at best by St Basil of Caesarea and St Gregory of Nyssa). By a short presentation of the struggle for orthodoxy during the fourth century, I try to place St Gregory of Nyssa's polemics with the radical Arians into a historical context. Subsequently, I pay attention to Aetius' legacy in Eunomius' works and biography, and their strong breaking points with the former tradition. The argument is carried on by a short presentation of Gregory's explicit rejection of Eunomius' theology. Consequently, I ponder upon the differences between the conflicting methodologies assumed by Eunomius and Gregory of Nyssa, respectively. The usage of rhetoric and dialectics for theological purposes is, in each case, highly significant. In contrast, I point out the importance of Basil and Gregory's doctrinal and spiritual commitments, which I regard in continuity with the apostolic confession of Christ as 'Lord and God' (John 20: 24). I suggest that the Trinitarian controversy can be ultimately traced back to the most important question for the early Christian Church: the confession of Christ's divinity and lordship. The present study also try to show that this confession is intimately related to the hermeneutical task of reading the Scriptures, which can always (and very easily) become an object of controversy when the 'hypothesis' of Christ's natural sonship is lost on the way. Without this 'hypothesis', the texts of the Old and the New Testament were open to endless and polemical interpretations, and the borderline between 'orthodoxy' and 'heresy' is lost.

*Keywords:* St Gregory of Nyssa, Eunomius, early Christian doctrine, Arianism, Christian Orthodoxy vs. Heresy.

**Martin Bodinger**, “Deux problèmes d’histoire des religions au monde antique: I. Le dieu Sabazios et le judaïsme”

The author proposes a reconsideration of the complex discussion regarding the figure of the God Sabazios, taking into debate the questions of the origin, the attributes, the name, the iconographie and the cult of this pre-christian God. It is on the problem of the cult that Bodinger’s article is mainly focussed on. As concerns the origin, the author stresses upon the hypothesis of the Thrace origin, taking as principal argument the fact that Thrace is the only place where Sabazios was not associated with other divinities; moreover it is here that one finds the most important ammount of representations and inscriptions, the traces of sanctuaries devoted to this God. As concerns the name, rejecting the arguments of Vernadsky and Bonfante, Bodinger is inclined to give favour to the solution proposed by the Romanian researcher Gh. Muju, according to which the name "Sabazios" comes from "sap", solution sustained by the classical sources which certify that sabaos means spring like sap. As concerns the cult, Bodinger discusses the threefold problem of the association between Sabazios, on the one hand, and, on the other hand, Dionysos, Yahwe, respectively Hypsistos. In the framework of the whole article, it is the second equation, Sabazios=Yahwe, which receives the main attention. Bodinger rejects Cumont’s hypothesis of a syncretism between Sabazios and Yahwe, leaning on the argument that the main source Cumont had used was not Valerius Maximus’ epitomes, but a later copy of these. In this way the author brings his analysis to the principal conclusion that it is out of discussion to have ever existed, in Rome or in any other place, any community of Jews devoted to the God Sabazios.

*Keywords:* God Sabazios; Sabazios; Dionysos; Yahwe and Hypsistos;

**Leonard Greenspoon**, “Joshua: A Man for All Seasons?”

The starting point of this article is the problematic situation in which is found the western scholarship dealing with the Hebrew Bible. Leonard Greenspoon identifies an increasingly fragmentation of the biblical research in the recent generations of researchers. Scholars “hardly speak the same language, and believing communities are ever more estranged from the world of arcane scholarship”. Greenspoon’s article attempts to give a reply to this situation, by proposing an integrative approach with respect to a single biblical character, namely Joshua. Subsequently, he provides a unified portrait of Joshua, gathering all the dominant attributes as they are allotted to this character in

different writings. More precisely, Joshua appears in the Hebrew Bible as follower, loyal to God and Moses; as holy warrior and as a royal figure; in the Septuagint, one deals with Joshua and the problem of circumcision, as well as with Joshua and Moses. T 3. In Josephus (Josephus and the Hellenistic ideal of leadership; Joshua and non-circumcision); 4. In Rabbinic Judaism (Joshua as holy warrior; Joshua as husband and father; Joshua as prophet); 5. In Christian traditions (Joshua and the moon; Joshua as successor to Moses; Joshua as forerunner of Jesus). The article ends with an Appendix on “Joshua in popular culture”, short complement based on the writings of Elie Wiesel.

*Keywords:* portrait of Joshua: Joshua as follower; loyal to God and Moses; Joshua as holy warrior; Joshua as royal figure; Joshua and circumcision; Joshua and Moses; Joshua and non-circumcision; Joshua as holy warrior; Joshua as forerunner of Jesus.

**Michiaki Okuyama**, “A History of Religion of the Other. Eliade’s Dialogical Methodology”.

Researcher at the Nanzan Institute for Religion and Culture (Nagoya, Japan), the author provides a short synthesis on Eliade’s theoretical discourse concerning the encounter between the East and West, from both the cultural and religious points of view. The main passages brought into discussion are quoted from Eliade’s works: *Images and Symbols: Studies in Religious Symbolism*, Princeton, 1991, *Myths, Dreams and Mysteries: The Encounter between Contemporary Faiths and Archaic Realities*, Harper Torchbooks, 1960, *Patterns in Comparative Religion*, University of Nebraska Press, 1996 and *The Quest: History and Meaning in Religion*, University of Chicago Press, 1984. Divided in two main parts, under the subtitles: “The Age of Encounter and Confrontation” and “Dialogue and Hermeneutics”, the articles ends up with the “Conclusion”, where Michiaki Okuyama takes also into account the critics brought to Eliade’s “dialogical methodology” by contemporary scholars, such as Douglas Allen and Carl Olson.

*Keywords:* Eliade’s theoretical discourse concerning the encounter between the East and West; from cultural and religious points of view;

**Bryan Rennie**, “Toward a Philosophical Anthropology of Religion: Reconciling a Naturalistic Approach to the Study of Religion with the Belief of the Believer”

The explicit intention of this article, as asserted by the author himself, is to illustrate the means by which a “fully rational recognition of the irreducibility of the belief of the believer” would be possible. In relation to the main paradigm of the study of religion used in the US, polarized between a

naturalistic approach and a theological approach, Rennie tends to avoid “a turn away from the naturalistic History of Religion”. In the constitution of his article, Rennie takes into discussion certain conceptual paradigms, characteristic - on the one hand - for the Anglo-American milieu of the study of religion, as reflected in the works of scholars such as: Clifford Geertz, Russell MacCutcheon, Ninian Smart, Nancy Frankenberry, Hans Penner, Burton Mack, on the other hand - for Eliade’s thought, illustrated mainly by the latter’s *Myth and Reality* (New York, 1963) and *The Quest: History and Meaning in Religion* (Chicago, 1969).

*Keywords:* Mircea Eliade; History of religions; religious theory; methodology; fully rational recognition of the irreducibility of the belief of the believer.

**Hans Thomas Hakl**, “*Eranos im Spiegel der Geistesgeschichte des 20. Jahrhunderts*”.

After the publication of the *Der verborgene Geist von Eranos. Unbekannte Begegnungen von Wissenschaft und esoterik. Eine alternative Geistesgeschichte des 20. Jahrhunderts* (Bretten, 2001) - the first, very complex and comprehensive monograph on the Eranos movement -, Hans Thomas Hakl provides a shorter synthesis on the main spiritual orientations of the principal representatives of the Eranos, namely Henry Corbin, Gershom Scholem and Mircea Eliade. One also finds a more integral view on the development of the general program of these annual meetings, initially limited to the problem of the encounter between the Eastern and the Western cultures, respectively. (It is worth remembering that for the first Eranostagung, at which C.G. Jung, Heinrich Zimmer and Erwin Rousselle took part in 1933, the subject of debate was “Yoga und Meditation im Osten und im Westen”. Later, the area of discussion was enlarged, reaching an inter-disciplinary profile, comprising disciplines such as Psychology, History of Religions, History of Art, Music, Philosophy, Politology, Physics and Biology. Particular attention is given the personality of the founder and promoter of this memorable series of meetings, Olga Frøbe Kapteyn.

*Keywords:* spiritual orientations of the principal representatives of the Eranos; Henry Corbin; Gershom Scholem and Mircea Eliade; 20<sup>th</sup> c. intellectual history, esotericism.

**Ovidiu Cristea**, “L’épilogue de la quatrième croisade vu par Henri de Valenciennes”

Researcher at the Institute for History «Nicolae Iorga» of the Romanian Academy (Bucharest), deals in this article with the medieval chronicle of

Henri de Valenciennes, entitled *Histoire de l'empereur Henri de Constantinople* (published by Jean Longnon at Paris in 1945). This is a direct testimony of the fall of Constantinople in 1204. In general, the historians, taking into account the projects of the crusade as drawn by Henri I de Hainaut, preserved the image, not totally unbiased (given its political and diplomatic connotations), that the Latins promoted the idea of a collaboration between Constantinople and Jerusalem. Valenciennes' text, being a direct testimony, reveals another point of view, according to which the Latins were to identify the war against the enemies of Constantinople with a new crusade.

*Keywords:* the fall of Constantinople (1204); history of the crusades; Henri de Valenciennes, medieval history.

**Mac Linscott Ricketts**, "Straightening Some 'Tangles' in the Tale of *Traité*"

A short rejoinder of the article on the genesis of Eliade's *Traité d'histoire des religions* published in *Archaeus* 4 (2000), after its discussion by Professor Jonathan Zettel Smith in a two-parts articles on the theoretical and analytical background of the writing of Eliade's *Patterns in Comparative Religion* (French ed. 1949, English transl. 1958), published in *History of Religions* (University of Chicago Press 2000).

*Keywords:* Mircea Eliade, *Patterns in Comparative Religion*, History of religions; methodology; debate; 20<sup>th</sup> c. intellectual history.

## VI (2002), fasc. 3-4

**Alessandro Stavru**, "*Wissensethik* versus *Willensethik*. Zu Walter F. Ottos Sokrates Vorlesungen".

The author, researcher at the "Oriental Institute" of Napoli, aims to bring new data and analysis about one of the most influential German historian, philologist and thinker, Walter F. Otto, a very respected name in the field of the history of Greek religion in the first half of 20th century. He discusses here the topic of his German lectures on Socrates thought in a difficult, but very rich period of his career and life (1940-1958), having access to his unpublished writings preserved in the "Deutschen Literaturarchiv", Marbach. Greek religion and thought are seen equally as crucial for the understanding of ancient Mediterranean religious movements and as a paradigm often structured by the very interpretation of Socrates' figure. All the relevant

material still accessible is carefully examined, and a future critical edition of it is finally foreseen.

*Keywords:* Walter F. Otto; lectures on Socrates; History of religions; historiography of ancient Greek religion; archive research; 20<sup>th</sup> c. intellectual history.

**Martin Bodinger**, “Deux problèmes d’histoire des religions au monde antique: II. Tacite et la « persécution néronienne »”

By a critical approach of Tacitus’ Histories, as well as of an important part of the historiographical works devoted to this classical source in the 20<sup>th</sup> century, Martin Bodinger subminates the ancient cliché, according to which the well-known persecution of the Christians under the rule of Neron is rather a fiction, propagated by Tacitus and assumed as such. Was Tacitus a liar in respect to this very historical fact? If Tacitus was wrong, why did the Christians accept and preserve his “invention”, which under no circumstances looks favourable to the image of Christianity? The conclusion is firmly argued at the end of Dr Bodinger’s study: “There was no persecution of the Christians under Neron. In fact, the persecutions did not take place but beginning with ‘70s of the 2nd century CE”.

*Keywords:* Tacitus; Neron and the Christians; 1<sup>st</sup> c. CE religious history; religious persecution; early Christianity.

**Mac Linscott Ricketts**, “Eliade and Goethe”

The purpose of this article is to establish to what extend the influence of Goethe’s morphology of plants on Eliade’s methodology in the history of religions is traceable and sustainable. In this respect, Ricketts makes use of as many as possible quotations from Eliade’s work, from the single article ever published by Eliade explicitly referring to Goethe, “Encheiris Naturae” (*Cuvântul* VIII, 1932, no. 2486) to the numerous autobiographical passages (in the *Journal*, *Autobiography* or the correspondence). An important, central, part of this article is devoted to the discussion of the possible major influence of Goethe’s Morphology of Plants on the construction itself of the *Traité d’histoire des religions*, question brought to light by Jonathan Z. Smith in an old article, “Adde Parvum Parvo Magnus Acervus Erit”, *History of Religions* 11 (1971), no. 1, reprinted in *Map Is not Territory*, Leiden, Brill, 1978. In response to this article, Ricketts gathers many, rather biographical, testimonies of Eliade concerning Goethe in order to sustain, as conclusion also, that Eliade “was unwilling to concede that his methodology was simply an «adaptation» of Goethe’s because, in his mind, it was his own creation”.

*Keywords:* Mircea Eliade; Johann Wolfgang Goethe; comparative history of religions; historiography of religion in 20<sup>th</sup> c.; Jonathan Z. Smith; intellectual history; morphology (of religion).

**Giovanni Casadio**, “Ioan Petru Culianu, ovvero la storia delle religioni come vita e come arte”

Ioan Petru Culianu (1950-1991) was one of the most talented historians of religions of his generation. The author addresses here a vivid portrait, both scientific and personal, about his friend, retracing, in a special manner, the itinerary of his life and academic career (Bucharest, Milan, Groningen and finally the Divinity School of the University of Chicago, where he was tragically and unfathomably murdered, 21st May 2001) and discussing some delicate topics of his writings (concerning gnosticism, both ancient and modern, otherworldly journeys, the history of magic etc.) and underlines his capacity to represent, on a world-wide scale, the legacy of some great “maîtres à penser” of the 20th century, but also to try to become - especially in the methodological debate around the structure of religion - one of them.

*Keywords:* Ioan Petru Culianu; Gnosticism (ancient and modern); otherworldly journeys; the history of magic; historiography of religion; 20<sup>th</sup> c. intellectual history.

**Mihaela Timuș & Eugen Ciurtin**, “The Unpublished Correspondence between Mircea Eliade and Stig Wikander (1948-1977) (Fourth Part)”

This fourth couple of letters exchanged between Eliade and Wikander covers the period of 1961-1977. It is the last part of the entire corpus of letter which counts a total of 74 letters (to which should be added one letter of Gunnel Wikander sent to Eliade on behalf of her husband). Besides different views concerning their personal circumstances of life, these letters bring testimony for a great variety of scholarly projects, some accomplished but others not. Among these, one should mention the series of Haskell Lectures which Stig Wikander held at Chicago, at Eliade’s invitation (1967, Fall). Unfortunately, Wikander did not manage to publish these lectures. In addition to this last body of Eliade-Wikander epistolary, the editors decided to publish a series of some other yet unpublished letters received by Eliade and Wikander, respectively. Thus, the reader can find in the two Addendum letters signed by Edmund von Lippmann, George Sarton, Rudolf Otto, Theodor Scherbatsky, Pierre-Maxime Schuhl, Louis Renou, Julius Evola and Geo Widengren (addressed to Eliade) or by Harold W. Bailey, Georges Dumézil, Lucien Gerschel, Joseph Kitagawa and Marijan Molé (addressed to Wikander). The

archival documents also include two supplements: *Addendum I: Other Letters of Mircea Eliade*. *Addendum II: Other Unpublished Letters of Stig Wikander*.

*Keywords:* History of religions; Stig Wikander; Mircea Eliade; 20<sup>th</sup> c. intellectual history; scholarly correspondence.

**Ovidiu Olar**, “Messaggeri e guerrieri alati nel basso Danubio (III-XII secoli)”

The aim of this article is to present some epigraphic, iconographic and literary sources concerning the puzzling destiny of a invisible population. We refer to the angels that inhabited the Lower Danube region between the 2nd century CE and the beginning of the 12th century CE. These sources provide an opportunity to take a closer look at the relation between the human and the Divine in the above mentioned frontier space. This is also a step towards a better understanding of the circulation of Christian ideas from the East to the West and from the West to the East.

*Keywords:* Christian Late Antiquity; Christian Early Middle Ages; angelology; iconography; Byzantine/Low Danube religious history.

**Gabriela Cursaru**, “Le dixième régal des Kernophoroi”

The tenth Feast of the Kernophoroi” depicts the most prodigious pathways of the ancient Greek route crossed by the heroic category and by the associated functional typology in its increasing complexity. The original Greek heroic character generates a polyhedral category that escapes a fixed classification while being liable to dangerously permissive and polysemous generalisations. The editors and the contributors to this Colloquium’s Acts inferred a series of this matter’s difficulties (such as the semantic ambiguity of the notion of heros, the heterogeneity/rarefaction of sources) and illustrated the main currents and approaches without the pretence of exhausting all potential perspectives on the subject. The achievement of this Colloquium spanned all areas of the heroic typology, from the lyric poem with its epic and elegiac precedents to tragedy, epigraphy, iconography, archaeology, from the archaic and geometric époque to the syncretism of the end of Antiquity.

*Keywords:* ancient Greek literature; *Kernos*; Kernophoroi; review article academic proceedings.

**RAPPORT D’ACTIVITÉ DE L’ASSOCIATION ROUMAINE  
D’HISTOIRE DES RELIGIONS (ARHR)**

(juin 2001 - novembre 2002)

### Book Reviews.

**E. MOUTSOPOULOS**, *Variations sur le thème du kairos de Socrate à Denys*, Paris, 2002 (*Eugen Ciurtin*); **SYMEON THE NEW THEOLOGIAN**, *Writings III (Hymns, Epistles, and Chapters)*, edited by diac. **Ioan I. ICĂ Jr.**, Sibiu, 2001 (*Mihail Neamțu*); **Rika GYSELEN** (éd.), *Démons et merveilles d'Orient*, série *Res Orientales XIII*, Paris, 2001 (*Mihaela Timuș*); **John BEHR**, *The Way to Nicaea*, Crestwood, NY, 2001 (*Mihail Neamțu*); **Mario BUSSAGLI, M. D'ONOFRIO** (a cura di), *Le Ali di Dio. Messageri e guerrieri alati tra Oriente e Occidente*, Roma, 2000 (*Ovidiu Olar*); **Richard Paul VAGGIONE**, *Eunomius of Cyzicus and the Nicene Revolution*, Oxford, 2000 (*Mihail Neamțu*); **Sabine SCHMIDTKE** (éd.), *Correspondance Corbin-Ivanow (1947-1966)*, Paris, 1999 (*Mihaela Timuș*); **Gail KLIEMAN**, *Nunta mortului*, Iași, 1998 (*Andrei Oișteanu*)

### NOTICES BIBLIOGRAPHIQUES / SHORT NOTICES

*Pentru o democrație a valorilor*, București, 2002 (*Mihail Neamțu*); Raymond KLIBANSKY, Erwin PANOFSKY, Fritz SAXL, *Saturn și melancolia*, Iași, 2002; Mircea HANDOCA (éd.), „*Dosarul*“ *Eliade*, vol. V (1937-1944) București, 2001; vol. VI (1944-1967), București, 2002 (*Mihaela Timuș*); AEGAEUM 22 (2001), POTNIA. *Deities and Religion in the Aegean Bronze Age*, eds. Robert LAFFINEUR and Robin HÄGG (*Gabriela Cursaru*); Mario GANDINI, “Raffaele Pettazzoni. Materiali per una biografia” (1933-1935), *Strada Maestra* 50.1, 51.2 (*Eugen Ciurtin*); Stefan ARVIDSSON, *Ariska Idoler. Den indoeuropeiska mytologin som ideologi och vetenskap*, Stockholm, 2000 (*Mihaela Timuș*); Nicolae ACHIMESCU, *Creștinism și budism. Considerații privind desăvârșirea omului*, Iași, 1999 (*Eugen Ciurtin*); Moses GASTER, *Memorii. Corespondență*, ediție îngrijită și adnotată de Victor ESKENASY, București, Hasefer, 1998 (*Eugen Ciurtin*)

### PUBLICATIONS REÇUES / RECEIVED

Publications reçues par la bibliothèque du Centre d'histoire des religions, Université de Bucarest (décembre 2001 - novembre 2002)

*Abstract.* A “List of Publications received” (2001-2002) by the Library of the Romanian Association for the History of Religions in Bucharest.

### ADDRESSES OF THE CONTRIBUTORS